

# **A CLOUD OVER BHOPAL**

CAUSES, CONSEQUENCES,  
AND  
CONSTRUCTIVE SOLUTIONS

by  
Alfred de Grazia

Metron Publications

ISBN: 978-1-60377-089-7

Library of Congress Catalog Number: 2014907481

Copyright © Alfred de Grazia, 1985, 2014

Second Edition

All Rights Reserved

METRON PUBLICATIONS

PRINCETON, NJ 08540-1213

To the memory of our dear friend,  
Dr RASHMI MAYUR.



The First Edition of this book was published by the Kalos Foundation for the India-America Committee for the Bhopal Victims. Metron Publications, P.O.Box 1213, Princeton, NJ 08542.

*The author wishes to express his thanks for the counsel given him by the members and friends of the India-America Committee for Bhopal Victims, especially to Dr. RASHMI MAYUR, Director, Urban Development Institute, collaborator on this and other projects of Kalos, and to Dr Kumudini Mayur; to Kevan Cleary, Tami Aisenson, Ward Morehouse and Clarence Dias. Most important, my wife, Anne-Marie de Grazia, collaborated with me throughout the difficult months of work in the field and in the study.*

## **Publisher's Note of April 1985**

Because of a wider expressed interest, this report, prepared for the use of the India-America Committee for Bhopal Victims, is being released to the public. Its publication may benefit those who need to know where matters stand and what issues now to pursue. The facts of the book are not final nor its judgements absolute. At this point in time, less than four months after the accident, many facts about the behavior of individuals, the deaths and damages, and the organization of responsibility have yet to come to light. The book is not written as a legal brief and ranges beyond the bounds of a court case. It presents hearsay evidence and many opinions and hypotheses waiting to be proven or disproved. Moreover, judicial processes will probably occur that have coercive means of eliciting documents and ascertaining facts. To avoid rendering judgements out of court and on the basis of the still incomplete evidence, the author has avoided, as far as possible, the use of proper names in the text. Despite these self-imposed limitations, the author stands firmly by his general interpretation and his proposals for compensation and reform.

## FOREWORD

As the gas cloud began to spread over the City of Bhopal in India shortly after midnight on December 3, 1984, equally tragic events were befalling humanity elsewhere in the world. To the West, a million Ethiopians were starving to death in the middle of civil wars. To the East of India, Vietnamese and Cambodian armies were slaughtering many thousands. To the Southeast, a violent ethnic conflict was upsetting the island republic of Sri Lanka threatening the lives and fortunes of thousands of persons. To the Northwest, two bloody wars were downing their victims by the thousands and four nations -- Afghanistan, The Soviet Union, Iran and Iraq -- were involved. We do not speak of            troubles along the vast Northwest regions of the Indian border. Only over the great ocean to the South of India did peace reign, and uneasily at that.

Within India itself, the month preceding the Bhopal tragedy had witnessed the crazed killing of thousands of innocent Sikh Indians in the aftermath of the assassination of Prime Minister Indira Gandhi, the number of deaths being on the order of that visited upon Bhopal by the killing cloud of gas. A pall of psychic depression already hung upon the City. Nor should one overlook, in seeking to view the Bhopal case in perspective, the toll that pesticides, such as were being made

*12A Cloud Over Bhopal*

at Bhopal, were taking around the world, an annual total of 10,000 fatalities and 375,000 poisonings in the Third World alone, according to the latest estimates; nor that a gas explosion a few days earlier had killed five hundred people in Mexico City, again poor people of the neighborhood.

These events are mentioned to fit the events at Bhopal into their place in a world society that cannot govern itself and take care of its people. But here we are charged to discover what happened at Bhopal. In that city, there occurred an immense and dramatic tragedy whose lessons are both local and worldwide. As we move out from the Center of India drawing upon these lessons, we can see the tragedy merging with the great stream of world tragedies that must be controlled all together, and the sooner the better, by a world power operating under a single benevolent and beneficent code of law and conduct.

I apologize to the victims for not describing fully their agonies and sorrows in this book. If I did, I could not possibly say all else that I need to say, which I believe to be in their interest and which is itself abbreviated. I realize also that the dying, the pain, the sorrow and the testimony are not yet ended.

Alfred de Grazia  
Bombay, India  
4th April, 1985.

## Contents

<b>FOREWORD.....</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>CHAPTER I.....</b>	<b>14</b>
In the Coolness of Night.....	14
<b>CHAPTER II.....</b>	<b>21</b>
To Cope with a Killing Cloud.....	21
<b>CHAPTER III.....</b>	<b>30</b>
The Medical Emergency and the Prognosis...	30
<b>CHAPTER IV.....</b>	<b>44</b>
Secrecy, Reductionism and the Press.....	44
<b>CHAPTER V.....</b>	<b>54</b>
Who Sues Whom for What?.....	54
<b>CHAPTER VI.....</b>	<b>72</b>
Causes and Negligence.....	72
<b>CHAPTER VII.....</b>	<b>117</b>
Damages and Compensation.....	117
<b>CHAPTER VIII.....</b>	<b>129</b>
Creative Liability.....	129
<b>CHAPTER IX.....</b>	<b>142</b>
The Worlds Chemical Crisis.....	142
<b>CHAPTER X.....</b>	<b>154</b>
A Dynamic Memorial for Bhopal.....	154
<b>APPENDIX &amp; POSTFACE.....</b>	<b>158</b>

## CHAPTER I

### *In the Coolness of Night*

The City of Bhopal is situated nicely upon the banks of two artificial lakes, created many centuries ago. It stands amidst the farms of a verdant plateau. It is the capital of the largest and center-most State of the Republic of India, Madhya Pradesh, whose population of some fifty-five millions contains a disproportionately large number of Moslems (there being 500 mosques in Bhopal alone), and also some ten million people still organized tribally. Per capita income in the State came to 1217 rupees (about \$100.00) in 1981, one of the lowest averages in India.

The City must now consist of a million persons, or at least did so before the tragedy. Its industries are few, the factory of the Union Carbide Company of India, formulating pesticides, being outstanding for size and modernity. It holds a Medical School and a Technical College. Communications with the outer world are by train and bus, supplemented by several airplane flights a day that pause at the City's decent

little airport before proceeding South or North. Automotive traffic on the highways to and from the city is slight. Still, enough traffic converges upon the several thoroughfares of the City to congest them.

Despite a number of elegantly constructed mosques and old houses, most of them approaching a desperation of disrepair, the total aspect of the City is unlikely to impress a stranger favorably. Actually there are few strangers, except from the villages around, and those who come to do business with the State Government, or to seek medical care at the free hospitals. (There is one hospital bed in the State for every four thousand inhabitants.)

On the more pleasant streets of the City the upper civil service, executives, proprietors and professional classes dwell; most people live in shabby but not unclean areas, and one wishes that he might go through town with a magical paint brush, because every wall, every interior, seems to want a coat of paint.

Unfortunately, when it came time for a sudden magic to strike Bhopal, it was not a bright paint, but instead an evil magic, a cloud of poison gas, disgorging from the best-painted, most modern part of the City, set apart from the rest by a tight, high wire fence, the Union Carbide complex, sixty acres of high technology complex on the northern outskirts of the City.

Is it superstition or some hidden rule that from the best-appearing the worst evil strikes? Was it not from Germany, cleanest and most advanced of countries, that there sprang suddenly the Nazi evil that almost destroyed Western civilization? Was it not from the immense factory of modern culture, the United States, where cities and farms are alike industrialized, that there appeared in the skies and upon the roads of Vietnam those splendid fleets of shiny aircraft and armored vehicles dealing out destruction to poor villages? For its own part, there is the high Soviet technology replicating the Vietnamese war in Afghanistan.

It is not superstition, but solid common sense, to pose the question of Bhopal in universal form : How can man use his

## *16A Cloud Over Bhopal*

most modern and ingenious developments in ways that will not turn upon his fellows and destroy them?

Every Indian city that can boast of progress must confess to the slums that come with progress. To create a new factory of the highest levels of design and technology employing one thousand workers in a fully modern setting is to create a shanty-town of 30,000 people. It is practically a sociological law, one which, however, has been given only cursory attention by those who try to build modernity by emplacing isolated scraps of it upon a traditional culture.

The phenomenon is not Indian, but worldwide. The phenomenon is also historic. As industry came to England, to France, Germany, old Russia, old America, it brought with it the same social movement. Myriads of people abandoned their villages to cluster around the new gods of industry so as to live a life that seemed a little better than the old one.

So the case of Bhopal is not unique, but typical, historically and today. One new "real" worker brings a family of half a dozen people, maybe more. These people attract more people. Some are relatives. Some are from nearby villages: they, too, hear the call of the city. There will be a little business to do because there is a little more money to circulate. Shops will be needed, and let us not be snobbish about what a shop must be like. A shop is a few vegetables; a shop is a man who fixes sandals with a hammer, pincers, a few nails and thongs; a shop is a person whose family goes out to find firewood, breaks it into little pieces, and sells it. In the end, a single well-employed worker will be supporting a family and auxiliary workers, and in part their families. We discover finally a ratio of one to twenty, and what began as a factory providing 1000 new job ends up supporting a large-sized town at the least, for we are not counting all the hopeful ones who move in and somehow add themselves to the already existing city economy, offering even cheaper services and labor. This ratio of "real" jobs is about one-fourth of the American ratio.

In the end, what it costs to keep one criminal in a New York State jail for a year, \$40,000 (never mind the equal costs

of putting him there in the first place) can keep 250 people going in India: civilized, decent, gentle, clean, and hardworking people who bear no grudge against the world. For such are the shantytown dwellers of Bhopal -- as elsewhere in India. And such are those who perhaps to the number of 60,000 (counting the rest of the victims as of higher socio-economic status) suffered most from the lowering and passing cloud of poison erupting out of high technology.

The cloud, called appropriately by some Indian newspapers "the killer-cloud", emerged in full hissing fury close to 1:00am from a venting tower, after passing through an apparatus designed to render harmless the poisonous gas of methyl-isocyanate (MIC). The gas ascended the vent pipe in a long-drawn-out explosion lasting for nearly two hours. It was initially propelled by the extremely high pressure of the tank that had held it in liquid form and emerged from the pipe into the atmosphere. Then, directed by the wind, it streamed out, not losing its internal turbulence until expanded and cooled. MIC has a density twice that of water, yet the cloud, both wind-propelled and self-propelled, could spread out far and wide while training its vapors along the ground.

The air temperature was in the mid-fifties Fahrenheit, a cool night for Bhopal. A fairly stiff breeze was blowing from the Northwest, from the countryside down upon the eastern sectors of the City. Both conditions -- the temperature and the wind -- were misfortunes: the chill air forced the hot and heavy poisoned moisture of the release to carry along close to the ground, preventing it from rising and dissipating.

The wind blew the gas through the most densely settled sectors of the city. About twenty-five square miles of territory were covered by lethal vapors during prolonged venting. Attempts at mapping the course of the cloud have produced differing configurations. A United Press International map, reproduced by the *New York Times*, pictured an overly well-defined course proceeding over adjoining shanty-towns, the railroad station and down through the southeastern part of the City. A map of B. K. Sharma of *India Today* presented a much more widely diffused pattern, which represented the many

## *18A Cloud Over Bhopal*

stories of poisoning in the downtown areas, and at the Straw Products Factory where many of the workers succumbed to gas, and at the hospitals and in the well-to-do areas. Figure 1 here follows the extensive view. No one questions that places most heavily affected were the congested slum colonies such as J. P. Nagar, Kazi Camp, Chola Kenchi, and Railroad Colony.

Even in the most tightly packed areas, the cloud did not behave uniformly. The variables that determined its fatality included the age and physical condition of the victims, one's sleeping posture, the position of one's mat or bed in relation to the open air, the varying use of cloths and water upon being struck by symptoms, and finally what must have been eddies, whorls, currents and pockets in the overall wave of poison.

The people knew right away the source of the poisonous air, although it was incredible and shocking. Thousands had fled their homes a few months before upon the occasion of a small discharge of gas and an associated rumor of disaster. Now they choked and screamed at one another to rise and flee, aiding each other when they could, the choking and gagging leading the fully blinded. Some stepped out of their huts at the first whiffs, strangling, and where too blinded to turn back in, were swept up in the gathering human torrent and often never saw their families, neighbors and friends again. Some fled in a fright that respected no one until they awakened as from a dream miles away. Havoc, chaos, madness in the mass: such words could be used for once literally.

No one ran toward the source of the cloud although to run against the wind would have been the rational action to take (as many who did not need to run said knowingly afterwards). Of course, they would have run up against the wire fence of the factory. To run crossways would imply that they would know the dimensions of the cloud; but so far as they knew the cloud might have been infinitely large. Wherever they turned they were met by a haze that worsened the choking, blindness and retching. Death and coma came as a final release from an excruciating agony, no matter whether

*In the Coolness of Night* 19

of minutes or hours. The merely injured would continue to suffer hours, days and weeks of torture.

To the dead left behind were joined those dying along the line of rout. The crowd grew to be enormous and moved rapidly. In three quarters of an hour, its original surviving members had rushed five kilometers. This we know by figuring from the time of the gas release to the time when the Director of Medical Services, hastening to discover the trouble, was met by the onrush of people and had his car turned around and boarded by a score of victims, several of whom had expired but were mounted by others on the hood and top anyway. All obstacles were overrun; every cart, bicycle, and car was pressed into service. The incapacitated were sometimes trampled in the dark tumult. The dead, the screaming wounded, were everywhere one turned. Although the crowd hardly needed to be exhorted, a police van could be heard creeping ahead with its loudspeaker blaring: "Run for your lives! Poisonous gas is coming!"

Cattle, pigs, goats and dogs were exterminated in the path of the cloud. Later on their carcasses marked the contours of the cloud upon the ground.

The workers in the factory saw the venting of gas from its first occurrence and they could run against its flow. They numbered about seventy-five persons and certainly did not constitute a trained and disciplined force that would venture forth in their vehicles (which did exist) and protective gear (which also existed in limited quantity, the oxygen masks being of twenty-minutes duration) to give first aid (of what kind?) to the people crying out for help (in the dark inaccessible corners unreachable save by stretcher -- what stretcher?). Emergency help from the factory was nil.

The whitish greenish gas thus extruded was sufficient to have killed the million people of Bhopal had they been equally exposed and had the gas been sprayed uniformly in 180 degrees of arc. It is believed by toxicologists and it has been made into a rule in India and the United States that one in fifty million parts of methyl-isocyanate is enough to cause harm to a human exposed to it in an eight-hour work day. Twenty

## *20A Cloud Over Bhopal*

parts per million will send a person into agonies within five minutes. MIC is so reactive that experts Arthur Palotta and E. J. Bergin suspect it to be potentially a mutagen, teratogen, and carcinogen.

A tank of MIC thus becomes a kind of neutron bomb capable of fusion and explosion simply by adding water to it: people are destroyed and property is preserved. It is a wonder that terrorists have not targeted MIC installations, but perhaps untrained employees in charge of unsafe systems can also do the job.

## CHAPTER II

### *To Cope with a Killing Cloud*

Late on the day of the disaster a figure of 600 deaths was being circulated. Each day for several days thereafter the number augmented by hundreds, and a statistical bifurcation manifested itself between conservative figures, which sought to stay under 2000, and radical figures, which began to soar over five thousand and achieved twenty thousand and even fifty three thousand, this last being a figure that was related to me by a respectable lawyer who claimed to have gotten it from a government geologist from Madhya Pradesh as well as other people who "ought to know".

Not without reason or support, I have settled upon a figure of 3000 dead, 10,000 seriously disabled, 20,000 significantly disabled, and 180,000 affected to minor degrees. Later on we shall have occasion to look at these figures more closely. Just now they are cited as a preliminary to describing how the institutions of the community responded to a disaster of such proportions.

The Union Carbide company was quite unready for the

emergency. It could render no aid to people. For all the good they did, the thousand employees and the Indian and world network of 100,000 employees and hundreds of offices and factories and outlets might as well have been on holiday. This slight exaggeration is aimed at stressing the purely local nature of the disaster and the total response that was levied upon an unprepared and poorly equipped community, and should be qualified to mention the individuals who later on pitched in to help the community; it also implies the confused nature of the little medical and humanitarian aid provided, the perhaps deliberately misleading responses to police inquiries as to what was going on at the plant, and the aborted siren blast. The siren was first turned on full to give the public alarm, then quickly muted to the level of an internal alarm, and only raised to the public level after the gas cloud had been discharged. This last matter should be investigated thoroughly. The action was in keeping with the company policy of reassurance to the authorities and public; it could well have been ordered, and in any event was a decision by a company employee.

The only excuse for what would appear to be criminal negligence here is stupidity and panic. One needs to discover the mechanism of the siren to see whether it consisted of two sirens, or one that could be raised or lowered in volume of sound. If two sirens, an excuse is practically inconceivable. If the latter, a single siren that could be adjusted, then the operator might reason falsely, thus: 'Loud is for the public; soft is for the plant; so first I will turn it on loud to warn the public and then I will turn it on soft to warn the plant. There is no way of warning both at the same time.' Anyhow, the men in the MIC unit area warned the other employees by siren, loudspeaker, and voice to flee and they all did so and in the right direction.

The top man, the Plant Manager, was alerted around 1:45 A.M. by a city magistrate who presumably heard some news from the police, who in turn had been alerted by the actual seepage of the vapors into the city police control room and by a roving inspector who reported in around 1:00 A.M. that some disturbance was occurring at the Union Carbide plant.

The Manager reached the site quickly, passing through a mist of MIC, which he opened his car window to sniff, and which caused him to tear and cough. By the time he reached the plant, the air there was breathable. He said that the plant telephones were not working. If so, it was because they had been abandoned, because the police had put through calls before his arrival and they had been told that the problem was under control. The national union leader of Union Carbide workers claims that the Plant Manager and Chemical Plant Manager called All-India Radio to alert and instruct the people, but the Radio station refused to alarm the public without permission of the Central Office.

Until the truth became all too obvious, plant officials claimed that they had stopped the leak in the fatal Tank 610, even adding that the feat had been accomplished in under an hour. Much later, it became apparent that the "leak" had not been plugged, but that all the MIC of Tank 610 had been exhausted, as cleanly as if by plan. Only a little vapor greeted the Indian Central Bureau of Investigation when it sought samples from it days later. The Plant Manager, with refreshing frankness, declined to call the accident a leak, as the New York Times and many of the press and public figures termed it, insisting that it was an 'uncontrolled emission.' In effect he was calling it a constrained, slow-motion explosion.

If there had occurred no other way for the gas to escape, it would have exploded the tank. The human effects then might have been greater or less, depending upon how much the pressure and heat would have diminished in bursting the container. The gas would have spread fast and low, killing many plant employees. Bursting water and gas pipes would have stimulated a continued vapor reaction. On the other hand, the explosion inside the tank might have exploded the other tanks and its cloud might have been distributed in all directions at first, and then spread over the whole south hemisphere that is, over the whole city.

A police inspector had alerted the police quickly, but the efforts of the police to alert the population ahead of the cloud of gas were unsuccessful. Phones aroused some and

## *24A Cloud Over Bhopal*

loudspeakers others, but both were most effective in the better residential districts where the gas was taking its smallest toll. Moreover there was some question as to the advice to give generally. The specific advice had to put the decision upon the individual and the individual had a hard choice to make: If you think you can evade the cloud then flee; if you think you cannot, close the windows and door and at the first sign of gas douse yourself in water and bury your face in wet cloths. (I would point out that in hot countries, houses are designed to admit outside air always, and anyhow most of them leak air.)

The police then joined in transporting victims to hospitals and burial grounds, for it was decided that the bodies had to be disposed of rapidly to avoid danger of plague and because there were too many victims to bury or burn ceremoniously. There seemed little likelihood, also, that identification could be accomplished in a large minority of cases. Looting was not much of a problem since practically everyone was in distress.

The Army Sub-area Commander was contacted by an ex-Brigadier General who was President of the Straw Products Company, with 176 employees working the night shift; they were assailed by the gas, and telephoned to him. The Army sent relief trucks promptly but many of the workers were stricken and some died. About 2:00 A.M. the Army Area Commander was reached and sent out a fleet of trucks that reached the devastated area within an hour. There began for the military a grim ordeal over the next few days of combing the houses for the dead and surviving. Other soldiers served as orderlies in the hospitals. The main activity now was in the hospitals, and can be described along with the several medical issues in the next chapter.

At Union Carbide's elegant headquarters in Danbury, Connecticut, away from the congestion and confusion of New York City and ten and a half hours behind events in Bhopal, the news brought shock and disbelief. No one was denying responsibility, or that the plant was part of themselves. The principal officer for environmental affairs assured interrogators that MIC was hardly lethal, rather a form of riot

gas causing tears and coughing. Announcement was made that experts would be quickly despatched to the scene from America. The Chairman consulted his conscience and in the face of opposition from his staff decided to leave for India and Bhopal. Diplomatic channels obtained for him a promise of entrance and exit. Meanwhile the company's public relations staff was stepping up its operations. Scores, if not hundreds, of "communications specialists" were hired to contain public hostility and alarm. They answered thousands of inquiries from the public, politicians, and the press. News briefings were frequent. The defensive instincts of the Company were manifesting themselves; orders were passed around the world to refer all inquiries to appropriate authorities and to allow no visitors on UC premises anywhere without special clearance. The Company began to dig itself in for a state of siege.

When the UC Chairman flew to Bhopal on Friday, December 7, he was met at the airport and arrested by police. He was charged with criminal negligence, released after several hours of detention in the comfort of the company guesthouse, had bail posted for his release, and flew in an Indian government aircraft back to New Delhi. There he visited the Indian Foreign Secretary, under escort by the U.S.A. charge d'affaires in an Embassy automobile, and spent the weekend before returning to the United States. He had decided against a news conference in India because of the expected hostility of the Indian press, a warranted fear, inasmuch as he had only a modest ameliorative program to offer and could hardly speak up proudly or even informedly of the events at the Bhopal plant.

The Chief Minister -- Americans would say "Governor" -- of Madhya Pradesh refused to meet with the Chairman and in fact had ordered his arrest along with the top officers of the Indian Union Carbide company. It was understood, however, that his safe return to America had been promised by the Union Government. An offer of a relief grant from the Indian company amounting to ten million rupees was announced coincidentally and was refused. The Chairman's visit was not then a success and the Chief Minister scored in political points;

## *26.A Cloud Over Bhopal*

however, not to have come would have appeared to be a heartless omission.

The State government was relatively inert, following upon the arrest of the Union Carbide officials and the seizing of the plant. Before then, forty hours after the disaster, a meeting of secretaries and heads of departments was called to coordinate emergency activity. A State Relief and Rehabilitation Committee was set up under the Chief Minister, which fissioned into two Committees. One, on finances, was to survey the damages but was overshadowed by the more ready Union Government relief payments. The other decided to distribute free milk to children and nursing mothers.

Besides preferring criminal charges against the managers, the State set up a Commission of Inquiry headed by a Justice of the High Court to investigate "into the events and circumstances of the accident, the adequacy of steps taken by the factory authorities, the adequacy of safety measures and their implementation in regard to measures for prevention of similar accidents in industries of this nature." The State has also served notice to Union Carbide of intended cancellation of its license to operate under the Insecticides Act of 1968, and the Chief Minister said that the plant would never open again. Further activity was expected upon the occasion of suits by the State against the Union Carbide interests in India and America, and upon the convening of the State Assembly, when hospital appropriations, industrial safety and rehabilitation measures would be taken up. At first the State denounced the American lawyers and then it began to sign up its own clients, until now 6000, and in March, with the Union Government, entered the U.S. Courts alongside the lawyers.

The incapacity of the State in the emergency is understandable. It possessed little in the way of equipment and few personnel trained for crisis management. Its own employees dispersed for their own safety. There exists no large welfare apparatus devoted to the problems of the poor. Confronted by a parade of demonstrators at the beginning of January, organized into a "People's Movement" to seek relief,

the Chief Minister could only seek to belittle their pressure tactics and at the same time to placate them with assurances of concern and help to come.

It needs be said that underlying the unrest in regard to the State and City governments was the feeling, rather more widespread in India than in the United States, that both the political and administrative branches were ordinarily corrupt. After the excuse of over-population, corruption is the most common reason given for the painfully slow progress of India toward providing its people with a decent existence. The same State Government, the press was quick to point out, had been warned in advance of potentially grave accidents likely to occur on the Union Carbide premises. The factory location had been defended by State officials both as safe and as too expensive to move. This was in December 1982. No one knows, but many suspect, that damaging facts will come to light in the courts when the record of inspections and the inspectors themselves are brought forward. It is possible that required inspections were not performed, or were performed in a perfunctory manner, and that known defects in safety systems will have been passed over, and further that inducements of various kinds may have been traded.

The Government of India was similarly handicapped in responding. The Prime Minister, like the State's Chief Minister, behaved as proper politicians should; their sincerity and sorrow were genuinely felt and appreciated, just as was mother Teresa's. The Central Government within days was distributing adequate quantities of wheat, rice, oil, sugar, and milk to residents of all the affected areas of the City. It also announced that it would pay RS. 10,000 (about \$800.00 U.S.) to every heir of a deceased victim, Rs.2000 to the seriously hurt, and 100 to 1000 to those less affected. These were called *ex gratia* payments, meaning free and unqualified, but serious problems arose in the course of paying out Rs.36.67 lakh (about \$300,000) to 5724 victims, and led after four days to a suspension of payments. Prompt resumption of payments was promised but only in mid-January and after some talk of popular demonstrations were some payments made to the

## *28.A Cloud Over Bhopal*

heirs of the dead. The problem of verification and administration was too great for the Government. The People's Movement was outraged. Why, they asked, should one hesitate to pay benefits on demand to the applicants from heavily affected areas? How, asked the bureaucrats, can we pay out money without proof? Some might cheat! They were using a figure of 1404 deaths, so announced by the State Government. No doubt the Union Government is feeling acutely the problems of determining personal damages and norms of compensation.

The Government of India, too, is planning to sue Union Carbide both in India and in the United States on behalf of the victims, and the State and Union Governments have in fact proceeded to join their suits in America. It is moot whether this action would deprive the victims of their individual rights to sue under Indian Constitutional Law, and under the American Constitution. To an individualist and libertarian it is ironical and delinquent parents suddenly appearing in loco parentis to represent their neglected and victimized children.

And, of course, the Indian Government has set up a Committee to study comparatively the methods of regulating hazardous industries around the world. Initial attempts of the Opposition to debate the issues of Bhopal in the Parliament were frustrated. Nor has the Opposition, severely reduced and divided following the recent elections, managed to establish a non-Governmental position respecting the Bhopal disaster.

If all of this seems a poor response by the collectivity of concerned institutions to a vast tragedy, we may console ourselves with several thoughts. First, it is doubtful that the immediate response to such a disaster in other countries would be markedly superior. Second, the crowd of destroyed and sickened people pulls itself together and heals itself in a rudimentary manner and instinctively, individually and by mutual aid, apart from the institutional machinery of the government, which claims in this modern age a total and glorious mission that as often as not it fails to perform. Moreover we have not yet dealt with the medical response,

*To Cope with a Killing Cloud*29

which was heroic. Fourth, the story is not finished; the possible outcomes of the devastation and decimation have not been related.

Finally, consider the victims, thousands in number arising out of the poorest of the Earth. Their own glorious annals deserve volumes. I cannot recount them here. Consider whoever was controlling trains at Bhopal. With people all around him stricken and crying out in agony and while others fled, himself half-blinded and hardly able to talk, he calls to the railway stations to the North and the South, telling them to stop the trains, keep them from entering the poisonous cloud at Bhopal. He died.

